Preparing Faculty to be Humanistic Mentors across the Continuum of Medical Education

Alice Fornari, EdD, RD
afornari@nshs.edu
Assistant Vice President, Faculty Development, Northwell Health
Associate Dean, Educational Resource Development,
Zucker School of Medicine
Who is in the audience
“WE MUST ACKNOWLEDGE... THAT THE MOST IMPORTANT, INDEED THE ONLY, THING WE HAVE TO OFFER OUR STUDENTS IS OURSELVES. EVERYTHING ELSE THE CAN READ IN A BOOK.”
DC TOSTESON
Today’s Objectives

Participants will be able to:

1. describe the theoretical background and evidence base for humanistic mentoring for their intended audience

2. describe how mentoring & role modeling are linked skills

3. Reflect on how the concepts presented can support humanistic mentoring at their own institution
Self-Reflection

• “Mentors are guides. They lead us along the journey of our lives. We trust them because they have been there before. They embody our hopes, cast light on the way ahead, interpret arcane signs, warn us of lurking dangers and point out unexpected delights along the way.” (Laurent A Daloz)

• “An activity that is based on ‘learning relationships’, which help people to take charge of their own development, to release their potential and to achieve results which they value” (Lakhani, Mayur)
What are your adjectives that describe a mentor?

- Think about being mentored or having a mentor:
  - Describe success (appreciative inquiry approach).
Clinical
Disciplined
Opportunity
Communicator
Expert
Well-read
Time
Creative
Patient
Research
Challenge
Ethical
Thoughtful
Feedback
Team
Role
Player
model
Reflective
Time
Curious
Listener
## Terminology Clarification

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Mentoring</th>
<th>Advising</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>➢ In a mentoring program, the relationship between mentor and mentee is reciprocal.</td>
<td>➢ In an advising program is the advisor is in control of the relationship.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>➢ The mentor listens and stimulates reflection in the mentee to promote career development, professional growth or satisfaction</td>
<td>➢ The advisor answers questions and gives advice, sharing their expertise and knowledge with the advisee.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Medical Education (practice) goes beyond learning (practicing) medicine; it is fundamentally about becoming a dedicated physician.” This forging of a professional identity, or formation, is both a process of personal development and a social enterprise, a process of becoming and contributing.”

Cook, Irby, O’Brien (2010)
Integrated Professional Identity Formation

Involves the process of becoming a professional...

- through expanding one’s knowledge, understanding, and skillful performance
- through engagement with other members of the profession (i.e. mentors), particularly those more experienced
- by deepening one’s commitment to the values and dispositions of the profession into habits of mind and heart
Mentoring is a Relationship

Mentor
- Someone who allows you to see the hope inside yourself

Mentee
- Someone with an identified need, with the goal of professional identity development

Developmental relationships in which both parties have a stake & good intentions
Types of Mentors

Content
- Content
  - Intellectual scholarly/project aspect of mentee career
  - Facilitates new ideas
  - Guides productivity
  - Cultivates academic credibility
  - Connects to peers/experts to increase network

Career/Process
- Career/Process
  - Career guidance & support
  - Formulates goal(s)
  - Provides feedback
  - Guides academic promotion
  - Coaches on position negotiations

How many mentors do we need?
Mentoring is a Relationship

To Sustain a Mentoring Relationship

- Deliberate Feedback
- Clear agreed upon expectations
- Responsible/accountable/respectful
- Clear Communication
- Roadmap-developmental
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tip</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Mentors need clear expectations of their roles &amp; enhanced listening and feedback skills</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Mentors need awareness of culture &amp; gender issues</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Mentors need to support their mentees but challenge them too</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.</td>
<td>Mentors need a forum to express their uncertainties and problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.</td>
<td>Mentors need to be aware of professional boundaries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6.</td>
<td>Mentors also need mentoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7.</td>
<td>Mentors need recognition</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8.</td>
<td>Mentors need to be rewarded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.</td>
<td>Mentoring needs protected time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10.</td>
<td>Mentors need support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11.</td>
<td>Encourage Peer Mentoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12.</td>
<td>Continuously evaluate the effectiveness of the mentoring programs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Why Humanistic Mentoring in Medical Education?

• To ensure professional identity formation of doctors who bring to patient care core values and virtues of the profession:
  • Integrity,
  • excellence,
  • compassion,
  • altruism,
  • respect,
  • empathy and
  • service
Supporting Evidence

Study I

Study Question:

Are faculty who receive an 18-month FD program that combines *experiential learning* with *reflection* better rated as humanistic teachers by students than controls?

29 intervention vs 47 controls from 5 medical schools

Branch, William T. et al, A good clinician and a caring person, Ac Med, vol 84, N01, Jan 2009, 177-126
Supporting Evidence

Results:

- Intervention group outperformed controls on all items on the Humanistic Practices Teaching Effectiveness Questionnaire (p=≤ .05) with 8-13% differences

**Study II:** Repeat study with 8 medical schools:

P=0.019 in favor of experimental group independent of gender, experience of faculty, specialty area, and/or overall teaching skills

Branch et al., Faculty Development to Enhance Humanistic Teaching and Role Modeling: A Collaborative Study at Eight Institutions J Gen Intern Med 29(9):1250–5
Study III: Long Term Follow Up Study

- **Method:** 1998 telephone interviews of 100 1989 and 1990 graduates (50 who had studied the Harvard New Pathway curriculum (NP), 50 who had studied the traditional curriculum

- **Results:** Differences between NP and traditional students in the humanism domain first appeared during medical school and residency and remained significant well into practice, suggesting that humanistic medicine can be taught and learned

Peters AS; Greenberger-Rosovsky R; Crowder C; Block SD; Moore GT. Long-term Outcomes of the New Pathway Program at Harvard Medical School: A Randomized Controlled Trial, Academic Medicine. 75(5):470-9, 2000 May.
Role Modeling

- Teachers need to be aware of the conscious and unconscious components of learning from role modeling, so the net effect of the process is positive.

- “Individuals admired for their ways of being and acting as professionals”
What makes for an effective role model?

- Clinical competence
  - KNOWLEDGE & SKILLS
- Teaching skills
  - TRANSMIT K & S
- Personal qualities
  - COMPASSION, INTEGRITY & HONESTY
WHERE DOES ROLE MODELING TAKE PLACE?

- FORMAL
- INFORMAL
- HIDDEN
KEY POINTS

- Be aware of what you are modeling
- Protect time to facilitate dialogue, reflection, and debrief with learners
- Articulate what you are role modeling: make the implicit explicit
Conclusion

Formation of Humanistic Doctors is Possible

- A teaching/role modeling exists
- Study evidence supports its success
- Use it to train both mentors and students
Creating a Mentoring Culture

- Aligns department & institution strategic goals/pathways with individuals
- Recruits & retains talent
- Improves leadership & teaching skills
- Enhances career development
- Acclimates faculty-eases onboarding
- High potential individuals are fast tracked
- Supports diversity
Creating a Mentoring Culture

- Need a process to assign/seek mentors
  - Content/project mentor
  - Career mentor
- Faculty Development: mentor role & mentee role
- Leadership support (respect, accountable, responsible)
- Dedicated time to meet, respecting as part of work day
There’s a thread you follow. It goes among things that change. But it doesn’t change. People wonder about what you are pursuing. You have to explain about the thread. But it is hard for others to see. While you hold it you can’t get lost. Tragedies happen; people get hurt or die; and you suffer and get old. Nothing you do can stop time’s unfolding. You don’t ever let go of the thread.

~ William Stafford ~
References


2. Lakhani, M. When I say... mentoring. Medical Education 2015; 49:757-8


5. Branch WT, Frankel R, Gracey C, Haidet PM, Weissmann P, Cantey ,


7. Branch WT. Teaching Professionalism and Humanistic Values:

8. Thorndyke L et al. Empowering Junior Faculty: Penn State’s Faculty development and Mentoring Program. Academic Medicine; 81/7: 668-73, July 2006
